REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR EQUITY IN RECRUITMENT AND RETENTION

Submitted to the Personnel & Finance Committee by the Personnel & Finance Subcommittee on Equity, Recruitment, and Retention

Final Report Approved by P & F ERR Subcommittee on December 8, 2023

TABLE OF CONTENTS

BACKGROUND

Subcommittee Creation

The County Board is committed to ensuring Dane County is an inclusive and supportive employer able to attract and retain high caliber public servants to serve the community. In order to further advance this commitment, the County Board approved a resolution (2021 RES-193 "2022 Dane County Operating Budget Appropriations Resolution") that called for the creation of a subcommittee to evaluate concerns regarding equity, recruitment, and retention, and to recommend options to address identified concerns to the Personnel and Finance Committee. A motion at the December 12, 2022, Personnel & Finance Committee meeting reaffirmed the creation of the subcommittee.

The motion specified that the Chair of the Personnel & Finance Committee would appoint a subcommittee comprising one representative from each employee group and union with the exception of the 720 employee group, which shall have two representatives, one representative from the Managerial Advisory Committee, two members from Personnel & Finance, one elected official, and one employee to represent the balance of employees of the county.

The motion further indicated that the subcommittee would meet monthly during the workday, with staff support provided by the Dane County Board Office, in order to assess these concerns and develop recommendations to be presented to the Personnel & Finance Committee by its meeting in December 2023, as well as during the 2024 budget meetings, if warranted.

The work of the subcommittee was anticipated to be completed by the end of 2023.

This report and the recommendations contained herein are the product of the Personnel & Finance Committee's Equity, Recruitment, and Retention Subcommittee's work in fulfillment of the objective stated in 2021 Resolution 193 and the appointment memorandum.

Subcommittee Membership

On January 9, 2023, Supervisor Elizabeth Doyle issued a memorandum appointing the following 12 members to the Personnel & Finance Committee's Equity, Recruitment, and Retention Subcommittee. [See APPENDIX D-1]

- Erik Anderson, Employee Group 65
- Carl Williams Jr., Employee Group 705
- Derek Wallace, Employee Group 720
- Sharron Hubbard-Moyer, Employee Group 720
- Joanne Weber, Employee Group 895
- Ariel Barak, Employee Group 1871
- Nani Gebrechristos, Employee Group 2634
- Shannon Maier, Managerial Advisory Committee
- Supervisor Mike Bare, Personnel and Finance Committee
- Supervisor Chuck Erickson, Personnel and Finance Committee
- Supervisor April Kigeya, Elected Official
- Ann McNeary, Employee to Represent the Balance of Employees of the County

On April 11, 2023, after two of the originally appointed subcommittee members were no longer able to serve on the subcommittee, Supervisor Doyle issued a second memorandum appointing the following two individuals to replace the two original members on the Personnel & Finance Committee's Equity, Recruitment, and Retention Subcommittee:

- Justin Fay, Representing BPHCC Local 705 (replacing Carl Williams, Jr.)
- Jennifer Sze, Employee to Represent the Balance of Employees of the County (replacing Ann McNeary)

The final changes to subcommittee membership occurred when two County Board supervisors resigned from the subcommittee. Supervisor Erickson resigned in June due to schedule concerns and Supervisor Bare resigned in August upon resigning from the County Board, leaving the subcommittee with 10 members.

The subcommittee would like to acknowledge the work of Lisa MacKinnon in staffing the subcommittee and drafting this report and recommendations.

PROCESS

2023 Meeting Schedule

All meetings of the subcommittee were hybrid meetings (accessible to subcommittee members and the public in person as well as online via a Zoom link) held once per month on Friday at noon in the City-County Building. The initial meeting of the subcommittee was called to order by Supervisor April Kigeya prior to election of officers. Supervisor Kigeya was elected to chair the subcommittee.

Meetings were held on the following dates:

January 27, 2023
March 3, 2023 (two March meetings were held to make up for the February date)
March 24, 2023
April 28, 2023
May 19, 2023
June 23, 2023 (Meeting cancelled due to lack of quorum)
July 28, 2023
August 18, 2023
September 22, 2023
October 20, 2023
November 17, 2023 (Meeting cancelled due to member schedule conflicts)
December 8, 2023

Topics Addressed and Actions Taken at Subcommittee Meetings

NOTE: A detailed record of the subcommittee meetings, including recordings and minutes with registration reports and records of public comment, can be accessed via the subcommittee's legislative page at:

[Dane County - Personnel & Finance Committee's Equity, Recruitment, & Retention Subcommittee (legistar.com)](legistar.com)

The subcommittee began by gathering background material on the topic in order to assess needs, gaps, current county efforts, and priorities. Specific topics discussed and presentations given at each meeting are underlined.

The first meeting on January 27th featured a review of the 2016 Racial Equity and Social Justice Team's Equity Assessment of Current Recruitment/Hiring Practices Report [See LINKS TO RESOURCES at end of report] and a discussion of current concerns regarding equity, recruitment, and retention along with what information is needed to address these concerns. Colleen Clark-Bernhardt, Manager of Policy and Practice Innovation in the Office of the County Board, presented a synopsis of the 2016 Assessment of Equity in Recruitment and Hiring that was completed by the RESJ Core team at the time. She noted that, with respect to the recommendations made in the assessment, if an employee group had an issue with any of the recommendations the issue was noted in the document next to the recommendation. Also noted was a letter from Neil Rainford, AFSCME Council 32, which was read before the Personnel and Finance Committee at the time, in response to the recommendations.

Subcommittee members discussed the history of the assessment and efforts that followed it, as well as asked for clarification from Employee Relations and the Office for Equity and Inclusion regarding which specific report recommendations had been implemented.
The subcommittee also discussed its scope and objectives and heard a staff report on the related 2023 UW La Follette Capstone Students Project.

The March 3rd meeting focused on subcommittee member introductions and statements of interest in the subcommittee's work and discussion of recommendations in the 2016 Equity in Recruitment Assessment identified for further attention by subcommittee members.

Representatives from Employee Relations and the Tamara D. Grigsby Office for Equity and Inclusion—Kabura Mukasa, Human Resources Manager; Katelyn Thurs, Human Resources Analyst; Alex Hauri, Human Resources Analyst; and Rodrigo Valdivia, Diversity Recruitment Specialist—presented on Dane County's recruitment process and responded to questions from the subcommittee members [See LINKS TO RESOURCES at end of report].

The March 24th meeting included a discussion of the recruitment and retention data for analysis by the La Follette Capstone Students Project on behalf of the Office of the County Board. The subcommittee reviewed the various data sets, discussed the data, and submitted a list of questions regarding the data sets to Employee Relations for clarification [See APPENDIX D-2]. The subcommittee also began discussion of ideas and priority areas regarding equity in recruitment and retention to begin forming a framework for its recommendations.

The April 28th meeting included a brief follow-up discussion of the recruitment and retention data analyzed and reported on by the UW La Follette Capstone Students Project, continuing discussion of ideas and priority areas regarding equity in recruitment and retention, discussion of ideas for the subcommittee's work plan, and a staff update on the Workplace Climate Assessment project being launched by the Office of the County Board as a part of its program evaluation and oversight role. Staff provided routine status updates to the subcommittee regarding the Workplace Climate Assessment at meetings.

The May 19th meeting included continuing discussions of ideas and priority areas regarding equity in recruitment and retention and ideas for subcommittee work plan.

Subcommittee members were asked to individually generate and submit to staff prior to the July subcommittee meeting their ideas and priorities regarding equity in recruitment and retention for recommendations to the Personnel and Finance Committee. Members were asked to note any recommendations that might have a 2024 budget impact, and also to indicate whether something was a high priority in order to help the subcommittee narrow down the list.

Rodrigo Valdivia, Diversity Recruitment Specialist, gave the subcommittee a briefing on the alternative selection hiring program [See LINKS TO RESOURCES at end of report].

The June 23rd meeting was cancelled due to lack of quorum.

The July 28th meeting featured a presentation by Pam Dunphy, Interim Director of the Dane County Highway Department, on the history of the department's highway intern [See LINKS TO RESOURCES at end of report]. Multiple people spoke about their experiences with the intern program, its status as a

model for how to develop and run a program of this sort, its challenges, its benefits, how it has evolved, and how it has affected workforce development for individuals who are underrepresented in highway work. Subcommittee members posed numerous questions to the speakers.

Speakers included:
- Miriam Morales, a graduate of the intern program, on behalf of Latino Academy of Workforce Development
- Edward Lee, on behalf of Urban League of Greater Madison
- Baltazar De Anda, on behalf of Latino Academy of Workforce Development
- Terry Burch, on behalf of self
- Jerry Mandli, on behalf of self

The other agenda topic for this meeting was a <u>discussion of ideas and priority areas regarding equity in recruitment and retention contained in a first draft of proposed recommendations</u> submitted by subcommittee members. Having run out of time, the subcommittee postponed this discussion to the August 18th agenda. Subcommittee members were asked to take the initial draft list of proposed recommendations and select up to 6 of their prioritized recommendations in each of three categories (general equity, recruitment, retention) and submit them to staff to create an updated list for the subcommittee's consideration at its August meeting. [See APPENDIX D-3 for initial First Draft of the Subcommittee's Recommendations Proposed for Discussion, Consideration, and Selection by Subcommittee for Submission to Personnel & Finance Committee].

Staff provided another update on the Dane County Government Workplace Climate Assessment.

The August 18th meeting focused on further <u>discussion and prioritization of proposed subcommittee recommendations regarding equity in recruitment and retention</u>. Subcommittee members worked through and collectively selected priorities for the retention section of the draft at this meeting and subcommittee members were asked to further refine and narrow their prioritized selections in each of the three recommendations categories and submit to staff for compilation. The goal was to have a sufficiently narrowed priority recommendation list at the September 22nd meeting in order to approve the content for a final recommendations list. The subcommittee also heard follow-up testimony from a number of speakers responding to the presentations on the Highway Intern Program at the subcommittee's July meeting, and providing additional information about the program.

The September 22nd meeting focused on discussion of the updated draft proposed recommendations list. The subcommittee started with first the budget-relevant recommendations so that Chair Kigeya could bring those to the Personnel and Finance Committee in time for budget consideration. Discussion focused on four proposals. The subcommittee discussed and further edited a few of the listed budget proposals and then voted on each budget-related item. The subcommittee moved to finalize the list of four budget recommendations as edited and to authorize Chair Kigeya to take the budget recommendations to the Personnel and Finance Committee. The motion was approved 6-1.

The subcommittee also participated in a virtual instant voting process to prioritize the remaining draft proposed recommendations in the General Equity and Recruitment sections (the subcommittee members were asked to vote "yes, include as priority" on only 3 items per section). The subcommittee then directed staff to update the draft list of proposed recommendations based on the voting and

discussion, including the subcommittee's previous (August 18 meeting) priority selections in the Retention section, and to bring the top priorities in each section to the next meeting for finalizing the recommendations list and the report.

The October 20ᵗʰ meeting focused exclusively on discussion of the updated second draft of the subcommittee report intended to be delivered to the Personnel & Finance Committee. This draft contained the prioritized recommendations selected based on the voting and discussion of the subcommittee during its August and September meetings. Subcommittee members went through the draft report, including reviewing the final list of recommendations in the draft report again, and recommended various additional edits to the draft report and recommendations.

The December 8ᵗʰ meeting focused on finalizing the report and recommendations and discussing the RFP for Ombuds Services. The report and recommendations will be reported to Personnel and Finance Committee, as well as delivered to the new Labor Relations Committee and Ombuds Committee. The subcommittee members indicated a desire to play a continuing role, including the continuation of the subcommittee, in advocating for implementation of the recommendations developed by the subcommittee.

Invited Presenters
The subcommittee invited the following individuals to offer presentations on selected issues regarding equity in recruitment and retention over the course of the subcommittee's work in 2023:

- Colleen Clark-Bernhardt, Manager of Policy and Practice Innovation in the Office of the County Board
- Kabura Mukasa, Human Resources Manager
- Katelyn Thurs, Human Resources Analyst
- Alex Hauri, Human Resources Analyst
- Rodrigo Valdivia, Diversity Recruitment Specialist
- Pam Dunphy, Interim Director of the Dane County Highway Department
- Miriam Morales, a graduate of the intern program, on behalf of Latino Academy of Workforce Development
- Edward Lee, on behalf of Urban League of Greater Madison
- Baltazar De Anda, on behalf of Latino Academy of Workforce Development
- Terry Burch, on behalf of self
- Jerry Mandli, on behalf of self

The subcommittee also relied generally upon recruitment and retention data and other information gathered from the Division of Employee Relations, the Division of Information Management, and the Tamara D. Grigsby Office for Equity and Inclusion.

In addition to the invited speakers, a number of individuals registered to speak publicly before the subcommittee on agenda topics. See the subcommittee's legislative page linked in this report for a record of the subcommittee's minutes, agendas, and recordings of the meetings [See LINKS TO RESOURCES at end of report].

The subcommittee thanks all of the above invited parties, as well as additional speakers who attended meetings and registered to speak, for their participation and their efforts to provide information to help it develop its recommendations.

Recommendations Selection Methodology

As outlined above in the section on Topics Addressed and Actions Taken at Subcommittee Meetings, before the subcommittee initiated its recommendation development process it focused on gathering information regarding county policy and procedure to provide background on what the county currently does to ensure equity in recruitment and retention of employees. This information included the recommendations from the earlier 2016 report on the topic and data that had been gathered for other recruitment and retention research by the UW La Follette Capstone Students Project.

The subcommittee arranged multiple opportunities to hear from and ask questions of county staff and participants in county programs regarding the above data and county processes and programs. There were also topic experts among the subcommittee membership who were asked to provide additional program and process information to the members as questions arose.

Once the subcommittee reviewed, discussed, and received requested clarifications regarding the data it had collected and the information presented by invited speakers, it set about compiling a list of proposed recommendations across three categories: General Equity, Recruitment, and Retention.

This was an iterative process over several months in which the subcommittee members individually submitted to staff their ideas for recommendations. Staff compiled the individual proposals into comprehensive draft documents for review and discussion by subcommittee members at successive meetings. After each discussion of a draft, subcommittee members were asked to review and then individually submit their further narrowed-down selections for priority recommendations based on subcommittee discussion and perceived greatest need and biggest impact. The subcommittee would then review and discuss the revised list of proposals at a successive meeting.

Note that the subcommittee decided that it wanted the original draft of all recommendations included in the Appendices section in order to allow the Personnel and Finance Committee members or other readers to have access to the full scope of recommendations that were originally submitted and considered by the subcommittee members. The subcommittee also indicated that Chair Kigeya would continue discussions with Personnel and Finance Chair Doyle to determine how the work of the subcommittee—including ongoing advocacy for implementation of the recommendations on equity in recruitment and retention—could continue with the subcommittee's involvement.

The final step of the selection process involved an instant voting method that was applied to the most recent draft of the narrowed-down recommendations at the August 18th meeting. Based on this process and further discussion of voting results, the subcommittee selected its final priority recommendations in each category to arrive at the prioritized final list of recommendations presented below.

SUBCOMMITTEE RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE PERSONNEL & FINANCE COMMITTEE

BUDGET-RELATED PROPOSED RECOMMENDATIONS OF P & F ERR SUBCOMMITTEE

1) **Recruitment: Changes to Employee Relations Advertising and Associated Budget**
   a. Employee Relations must advertise on more platforms (i.e., LinkedIn, Twitter, etc.; Neogov and Indeed are not enough). Increase budget to advertise with UMOJA, Black Chamber of Commerce, and BIPOC Trade associations, e.g., National Association of Black Social Workers, Multicultural Student Centers, UW Odyssey Project, Local Black Fraternities and Sororities. Positions should be advertised in associations, e.g., Dane County is short on Social Workers and the Social Work position is not posted on the National Association of Social Workers (NASW), but there are 20+ other positions in the Madison area. Employee Relations should consult with department heads and line staff about ideas for places or groups that would be relevant to advertise to.
   b. Employee Relations needs an advertising budget to ensure that postings are advertised appropriately so that it's not a burden on individual departments to budget for advertising positions.

2) **Recruitment: County Supported Apprenticeships, Internships, Training, and Mentoring Across All Skill Levels**
   a. Dane County should maintain and develop relationships with universities, technical colleges, and trade schools to recruit graduates. The county should have a presence at job fairs, and other employment-related events.
   b. Develop a summer apprenticeship work program focusing on entry-level positions like janitors. Maybe we could go through the Urban League, Boys and Girls Club, and similar organizations for a list of viable candidates and consider creating pipelines for positions that are often vacant (such as the one used by the Latino Academy of Workforce Development). This is already the process with certain positions, such as Badger Prairie CNAs, and it could be expanded after an evaluation of which positions are sitting open and unfilled for long periods of time. A program like this would be a positive start for young adults who are maybe not planning on attending college at that point in their lives and at the same time create a positive talent pool for entry-level positions.
   c. Allow ongoing open recruitment / alternative selection for hard-to-fill positions or positions that are frequently open and unfilled for long periods of time.
   d. Expand funding for professional internships and temporary project assistant programs to support and assist the work of professional staff. Develop relationships with a variety of University and College programs (UW, MATC, UW-Milwaukee) to provide students with meaningful work experience that helps further the mission of the county department and allows senior staff an opportunity to mentor and work with younger workers.

   VOTE: voice vote—AYE unanimous

3) **Retention: Invest in and Implement an Evaluation System**
   There needs to be an evaluation system for all Dane County employees with opportunity for employees to evaluate their immediate supervisor and manager. This system should be comprehensive and inclusive, it should come from diverse polling, and would bring equity to the table. Currently no such system exists and creating one should ensure accountability and transparency via an ongoing process that allows for reviewing the results of evaluations, following up, and gauging implementation response and results. Employee evaluation has direct correlation to retention** (Example of a type of program that facilitates this: LATTICE program used by PHMDC.)

   VOTE: voice vote—AYE unanimous

4) **Elimination and Replacement of Position:**
   In Highway Department: Eliminate skilled labor training position and replace with skilled labor position (both F-14 positions currently)

   (N**ote:** This was not a unanimous decision by the subcommittee. The roll call vote is reflected below. Maier voted no on the motion to forward these budget recommendations based on disagreeing with this 4th recommendation.)

   ROLL CALL VOTE: Passed 4-3

   AYEs=include in recommendations/ Nos=do not include in recommendations/

   Weber: No

   Maier: No

   Gebrechristos: No

   Hubbard Moyer: Aye

   Wallace: Aye

   Barak: Aye

   Anderson: Aye

   Absent from meeting and voting: Kigeya, Sze, Fay

EQUITY—GENERAL
1) Try to ensure the grading and interview panels are diverse. Interview panels should include at least one member from outside county government to reduce "groupthink."
2) Institute a Bias Awareness for Interview Panel Members per Tacoma Washington on the types of stereotypes and bias (Halo effect, Pitchfork effect, recency, like me, etc.) inherent in people and how to try to mitigate them. This can be a mini-training/refresher right before interviewing or reviewing questionnaires each time someone is scoring.
3) Interview process should include at least one Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion question from the sample options – see Port of Seattle for questions/process.

4) Employee Relations must be staffed to attend job fairs at Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCU's) and other venues/events/conferences where BIPOC and LGBTQ+ candidates are most likely to be if equity and diversity are truly a priority.

RECRUITMENT

1) **BUDGET: County Supported Apprenticeships, Internships, Training, and Mentoring Across All Skill Levels (Included in Budget-Related Recommendations above)**
    a. Dane County should maintain and develop relationships with universities, technical colleges, and trade schools to recruit graduates. The county should have a presence at job fairs, and other employment-related events.
    b. Develop a summer apprenticeship work program focusing on entry-level positions like janitors. Maybe we could go through the Urban League, Boys and Girls Club, and similar organizations for a list of viable candidates and consider creating pipelines for positions that are often vacant (such as the one used by the Latino Academy of Workforce Development). This is already the process with certain positions, such as Badger Prairie CNAs, and it could be expanded after an evaluation of which positions are sitting open and unfilled for long periods of time. A program like this would be a positive start for young adults who are maybe not planning on attending college at that point in their lives and at the same time create a positive talent pool for entry-level positions.
    c. Allow ongoing open recruitment / alternative selection for hard-to-fill positions or positions that are frequently open and unfilled for long periods of time.
    d. Expand funding for professional internships and temporary project assistant programs to support and assist the work of professional staff. Develop relationships with a variety of University and College programs (UW, MATC, UW-Milwaukee, etc.) to provide students with meaningful work experience that helps further the mission of the county department and allows senior staff an opportunity to mentor and work with younger workers.

2) Address slow time-to-fill, which creates burden on the unit as the work doesn't go away. The risk of burnout increases as more work is added onto the plate. Publish average time-to-fill data by department and countywide on the intranet/internet on a regular basis [Assumes an internal evaluation is conducted and steps taken to decrease the time between application and interview / start date]

3) **BUDGET: Changes to Employee Relations Advertising and Associated Budget (Included in Budget-Related Recommendations above)**
    a. Employee Relations must advertise on more platforms (i.e., LinkedIn, Twitter, etc.; Neogov and Indeed are not enough). Increase budget to advertise with UMOJA, Black Chamber of Commerce, and BIPOC Trade associations, e.g., National Association of Black Social Workers, Multicultural Student Centers, UW Odyssey Project, Local Black Fraternities and Sororities. Positions should be advertised in associations, e.g., Dane County is short on Social Workers and the Social Work position is not posted on the National Association of Social Workers (NASW), but there are 20+ other positions in the Madison area. Employee Relations should consult with department heads and line staff about ideas for places or groups that would be relevant to advertise to.
    b. Employee Relations needs an advertising budget to ensure that postings are advertised appropriately so that it's not a burden on individual departments to budget for advertising positions.

4) Consider allowing line staff to grade applications or participate in interviews. This will reduce workload by increasing time to fill and help increase the sense of a team atmosphere. Further, line staff are most familiar with the work that needs to be done and the skillsets required.

5) Quality and frequency of communications and updates with applicants during the process should be improved. Offer an immediate response when applications are submitted online and let applicant know right away that the application materials will be processed approximately within a designated number of weeks. Example message: "Thank you for applying for a position at Dane County. Your job application and employment inquiry is important to us. We will review all information provided and will respond to you as soon as possible within [insert number] days or weeks." Be sure templates are updated and demonstrate a warm touch.

RETENTION

1) **BUDGET: Invest in and Implement an Evaluation System (Included in Budget-Related Recommendations above)**
There needs to be an evaluation system for all Dane County employees with opportunity for employees to evaluate their immediate supervisor and manager. This system should be comprehensive and inclusive, it should come from diverse polling, and would bring equity to the table. Currently no such system exists and creating one should ensure accountability and transparency via an ongoing process that allows for reviewing the results of evaluations, following up, and gauging implementation response and results. Employee evaluation has direct correlation to retention** (Example of a type of program that facilitates this: LATTICE program used by PHMDC.)

2) **Recommend that the County address the following topics in its work**:
    a. **HIGH PRIORITY:** Develop a separate mediation process for employees who are having challenges with supervisors. There needs to be a non-biased arbitrator available for all staff in this situation (unrelated to employee groups and sanctioned by DOA). There are current situations where staff are dealing with hostile and heavy handed managers who are not open to communication and who are not held accountable by their own managers. People don't trust the current mechanisms to deal with bullying, retaliation, and discrimination at the county. This situation is stacked against individual employees who feel powerless and without voice and end up leaving County employment. We need to hear people's voices through a **countywide climate survey** on an ongoing basis and also by offering opportunities for check-ins. We must practice trauma informed care, allow staff to pick a space and time that feels safe and comfortable for regular check-in (Quarterly or every 6 mo.) Ideally we should not wait until people leave their positions to find out what is going on, to see if there are patterns to pay attention to, and learn how we can support staff and keep them.
    b. **HIGH PRIORITY:** Focus on developing a transparent system for conducting, disseminating and acting upon the information provided in **exit interviews**. Again, it is essential for employees to feel safe and free to be candid during the process, and the involvement of a non-biased mediator would be optimal. Create a system where all employees who give notice are contacted and supported through the exit interview process. It needs to be clear what happens to this information after it is provided: How is the information / data provided used for the good? How does feedback get passed down to supervisors if necessary? How are changes that may impact retention made based on the information provided? Make sure **all** staff are aware of the exit interview process and who has access to

the information gathered from employees. ER, employee group reps, supervisors should review the information gathered as this is best practice and brings accountability. Employee Relations should compile an annual report on exit interviews, identifying common themes and include recommendations for improvement.

3) Publish retention data on the intranet/internet on a regular basis at the county, department, and division level. Depending on the size of the Department/Division, look at retention by Race/Ethnicity, Gender, Years of Employment, etc. Address concern re: easily identifiable employees in smaller departments by aggregating data reported or otherwise maintaining anonymity.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX D-1

Memorandum appointing members to the Personnel & Finance Committee's Equity, Recruitment, and Retention Subcommittee

Office of the County Board
Dane County Board of Supervisors
Room 362 City-County Building
210 Martin Luther King Jr. Blvd.
Madison, WI 53703-3342

Supervisor Elizabeth Doyle
(608) 616-0698

January 9, 2023

TO: Interested Parties
           Scott McDonell, Dane County Clerk

FROM: Supervisor Elizabeth Doyle, District 1

SUBJECT: Appointment of Members to the Personnel & Finance Committee's
           Equity, Recruitment, & Retention Subcommittee

The County Board is committed to ensuring Dane County is an inclusive and supportive employer able to attract and retain high caliber public servants to serve the community. In order to achieve this, the County Board approved a resolution (2021 RES-193 "2022 Dane County Operating Budget Appropriations Resolution") that calls for the creation of a subcommittee to evaluate concerns regarding equity, recruitment, retention and recommend options addressing identified concerns to the Personnel & Finance Committee. A motion at the December 12th Personnel and Finance meeting reaffirmed the creation of the subcommittee. It is anticipated that the work of the subcommittee will be completed by the end of 2023.

The motion specified that the Chair of the Personnel & Finance Committee appoint a subcommittee comprising one representative from each employee group and union with the exception of the 720 employee group, which shall have two representatives, one representative from the Managerial Advisory Committee, two members from Personnel & Finance, one elected official, and one employee to represent the balance of employees of the county.

By way of this memorandum, today I am creating the Personnel & Finance Committee's Equity, Recruitment, & Retention Subcommittee, and appointing the following individuals to serve on it:

- Erik Anderson, Employee Group 65
- Carl Williams Jr., Employee Group 705
- Derek Wallace, Employee Group 720
- Sharron Hubbard-Moyer, Employee Group 720
- Joanne Weber, Employee Group 895
- Ariel Barak, Employee Group 1871
- Nani Gebrechristos, Employee Group 2634
- Shannon Maier, Managerial Advisory Committee
- Supervisor Mike Bare, Personnel and Finance Committee
- Supervisor Chuck Erickson, Personnel and Finance Committee
- Supervisor April Kigeya, Elected Official
- Ann McNeary, Employee to Represent the Balance of Employees of the County

The Dane County Board Office will provide staff support to the subcommittee. The initial hybrid meeting of the subcommittee will be called to order by Supervisor Kigeya prior to election of officers. It will be at 12:00 PM on Friday, January 27th, in City-County Building room 354 as well as virtually via Zoom, and will feature a review of the 2016 Racial Equity and Social Justice Team's Equity Assessment of Current Recruitment/Hiring Practices Report and a discussion of current concerns regarding equity, recruitment, and retention along with what information is needed to address these concerns. The subcommittee will meet monthly during the workday in order to assess these concerns and will present its recommendations to the Personnel & Finance Committee by its meeting in December 2023. Recommendations can also be presented to the Personnel & Finance Committee during the 2024 budget meetings, if available.

APPENDIX D-2
**List of subcommittee questions and Employee Relations responses regarding
UW La Follette Capstone Students Project data
March 24, 2023 meeting**

The P and F Subcommittee at its March 24th meeting had a couple of questions for Employee Relations regarding the data the UW La Follette Capstone students were given (they reviewed and discussed it at their meeting). Below are the subcommittee's questions and responses from the Employee Relations Division:

Question:

What does it mean when the requisition shows negative "days to fill"? Is there an explanation for this?

Response:

The 0 days to fill were all listed with the filling of a limited term position. That means the department had someone to hire (i.e., Former employee) and we hired immediately.

Question:

Can the recruitment process be tracked: e.g., from the time when a positon is approved to the time it takes for requisition, to determine where and why there are lags in hiring and to determine what portion of "dates to fill" stays in various stages (advertising, requisition, etc.) for periods of time?

Response:

There is a report in NEOGOV called requisition life cycle (ex. See attached requisition life cycle spreadsheet for 2022).

Question:

In the termination spreadsheet the designations "termination" and "discharge" seem interchangeable in some cases. Who decides which terms and rationales for termination get recorded and would it be possible to standardize the terms (e.g., the subcommittee was not sure if termination sometimes meant discharged because the dept. just indicates termination and therefore one can't tell if it was voluntary or involuntary termination)?

Response:

Termination and resignation are more interchangeable than discharge. I only saw discharge-dnpp on the 2022 log and those are employee who are let go during probation for failure to perform the job. The termination I looked up was an employee who resigned. Alex/Mike maybe we discuss how these get coded when entered into the system so we are consistent. Several areas must be updated in order to effectively disable a profile in nextgen. The current process is to originally terminate everyone and then update their status based on information provided by each department. From my experience, the most common designations are terminate, resign and retire.

Question:

For the information (volunteered by the applicants) re: where an applicant saw the job posting, there is a broad "internet" category. The subcommittee thought there'd be value in getting more detailed information about specific internet sites rather than just "internet." One suggestion was to remove the broad "internet" category so that a more detailed site could be indicated. Is that a possibility?

Response:

We can list specific internet sites. The question in NEOGOV is a select from choices answer so I am unable to put in there, please type what internet site.

Question:

Finally, the subcommittee was wondering if there is a way for the "applicant statistics by job" data to be compared one-for-one directly to the "requisition" data so that, for instance, a person could easily see "Job X had 12 applicants with xyz EEO stats and the requisition for Job X shows someone with abc EEO stats was ultimately hired."

Response:

There is a report for this called "applicants by step", but it has to be run by a specific exam plan, meaning we have to pull up by specific open position. There are over 600 of these annually.

APPENDIX D-3

7-28-23 First Draft of Personnel & Finance Subcommittee on Equity, Recruitment, and Retention Recommendations Proposed for Discussion, Consideration, and Selection by Subcommittee for Submission to Personnel & Finance Committee

Note: The subcommittee members submitted these draft proposed recommendations and then worked from this original draft to select, prioritize, and narrow down its final recommendations, which start on page 10 of this report.

EQUITY—GENERAL

1) Institute a Bias Awareness for Interview Panel Members per Tacoma Washington on the types of stereotypes and bias (halo effect, pitchfork effect, recency, like me, etc.) inherent in people and how to try to mitigate them. This can be a mini-training/refresher right before interviewing or reviewing questionnaires each time someone is scoring.
2) Try to ensure the grading and interview panels are diverse. Interview panels should include at least one member from outside county government to reduce "groupthink."
3) Interview process should include at least one Equity, Diversity, and Inclusion question from the sample options – see Port of Seattle for questions/process.
4) ER must be staffed to attend job fairs at Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCU's) and other venues/events/conferences where BIPOC and LGBTQ+ candidates are most likely to be if equity and diversity are truly a priority.
5) Budget to advertise with UMOJA, Black Chamber of Commerce, BIPOC Trade associations i.e. National Association of Black Social Workers, Multicultural Student Centers, UW Odyssey Project, etc.
6) Create Affinity groups for county employees.
7) Develop cultural competency plan/training.
8) Expand funding for professional internships and temporary project assistant programs to support and assist the work of professional staff. Develop relationships with a variety of University and College programs (UW, MATC, UW-Milwaukee) to provide students with meaningful work experience that helps further the mission of the county department and allows senior staff an opportunity to mentor and work with younger workers.

RECRUITMENT

1) Conduct an internal evaluation and take steps to decrease the time between application and interview / start date. My supervisor shared recently that he was reaching out to schedule interviews with applicants 120 days after they had first applied due to the lengthy multi-step process currently in effect. Many qualified and diverse applicants will find alternate opportunities and go elsewhere and it is important to develop a system where we can recruit desirable candidates before someone else does. It is not feasible for some candidates who are needing an income to wait many months to be hired. They may take an alternate position in the interim and end up staying there. There is also a heavy burden on staff who are working in understaffed departments who are at higher risk for burnout, job dissatisfaction and mental health issues.
2) Allow ongoing open recruitment / alternative selection for hard to fill positions or positions that are frequently open. I believe this is already the process with certain positions such as Badger

Prairie CNAs and think it could be expanded after an evaluation of which positions are sitting open and unfilled for long periods of time.

3) Develop a summer apprenticeship work program focusing on entry level positions like janitors. Maybe we could go through the Urban League, Boys and Girls Club, or other similar organizations for a list of viable interested candidates. From there the candidates can be paired with janitors working at a wide array of County Buildings. Each building would not only be different in terms of nomenclature, but duties as well, ensuring that the group would receive well-rounded job experience. I know that there would be a lot of issues to iron out with my recommendation such as budget. I feel, however, that a program like this would be a positive start for young adults who are maybe not planning on attending college at that point in their lives and at the same time create a positive talent pool for entry-level positions.

4) ER must advertise on more platforms i.e. LinkedIn, Twitter, etc. Neogov and Indeed are not enough.

5) ER should advertise positions in associations, i.e., We're short Social Workers and the Social Work position is not posted on National Association of Social Workers (NASW), but there are 20+ other positions in the Madison area. ER should consult with Department Heads and line staff about ideas for places or groups that would be relevant.

6) **2024 BUDGET:** ER needs an advertising budget to be sure that postings are advertised appropriately so that it's not a burden of an individual department to budget for advertising positions.

7) Is Dane County ER appropriately staffed to do the work to be sure we have the best candidates? What is our HR to Employee Ratio? Industry standard for an organization our size is 1.03[1] per 100 FTE. The City of Madison reports 18 FTE with 2,764 permanent employees =0.65/100.

8) What is our average Time to Fill? Industry standard for an organization our size is 46 days. Highly qualified staff are also receiving offers from other employers and we may lose out on them if they accept offers elsewhere first.

9) Publish average Time-to-Fill data on the intranet/internet on a regular basis.

10) Consider reducing the # of AHQ questions to reduce the burden to apply and grade applications.

11) Consider allowing line staff to grade applications or participate in interviews. This will reduce workload by increasing time to fill and help increase the sense of a team atmosphere. Further, line staff are most familiar with the work that needs to be done and the skillsets required.

12) Consider creating pipelines for positions that are often vacant similar to that of the Latino Academy of Workforce Development.

13) Dane County should maintain and develop relationships with universities, technical colleges and trade schools to recruit graduates. The county should have a presence at job fairs, and other employment related events.

14) Are managers properly trained on the hiring process? Do they have appropriate expertise if they are hiring irregularly?

15) Quality and frequency of communications/updates with applicants while in the process is lacking and cold. Be sure templates are updated and demonstrate a warm touch. Both for applicants and for hiring managers.

16) **HIGH PRIORITY, 2024 BUDGET:** Audit of appropriate county clerical staff ratios

17) MEDIUM PRIORITY, 2024 BUDGET: Audit of appropriate managerial staff ratios

---

[1] https://www.shrm.org/resourcesandtools/business-solutions/documents/organizational%20staff%20size.pdf

18) LOWER PRIORITY, 2024 BUDGET: Audit of "double filling" process/practices

RETENTION

4) **HIGH PRIORITY, 2024 BUDGET:** Develop a separate mediation process for employees who are having challenges with supervisors. There needs to be a non-biased arbitrator available for all staff in this situation (unrelated to employee groups and sanctioned by DOA). There are current situations where staff are dealing with hostile and heavy handed managers who are not open to communication and who are not held accountable by their own managers. This situation is stacked against individual employees who feel powerless and without voice and end up leaving County employment.

5) **HIGH PRIORITY, 2024 BUDGET**: Focus on developing a transparent system for conducting, disseminating and acting upon the information provided in exit interviews. Again, it is essential for employees to feel safe and free to be candid during the process, and the involvement of a non-biased mediator would be optimal. I suggest creating a system where all employees who give notice are contacted and supported through the exit interview process. It needs to be clear what happens to this information after it is provided. How is the information / data provided used for the good, how does feedback get passed down to supervisors if necessary, how are changes that may impact retention made based on the information provided?

6) Consider offering part time (appropriately benefitted) positions, especially to nurses, as it has been suggested in multiple surveys of nursing staff elsewhere that part time employment is preferred for work/life balance and mental health.

7) Additional Step at 21 years – 1871 members have their last raise at 16 years, which means many will look for work somewhere else to earn a higher salary.

8) Telecommuting is major quality of life factor – not all employees are offered telecommuting equally and it is a very important part of the new labor market

9) We need some mechanism for staff to evaluate their supervisors on an annual basis…something like a 360 performance evaluation. This feedback then needs to go to their supervisor's supervisor so that it can't be buried.

10) We also need a county-wide climate survey on an ongoing basis. People don't trust the current mechanisms to deal with bullying, retaliation, and discrimination at the county.

11) Mandate that exit interviews are sent out to every employee who leaves Dane County as part of the off boarding process. These should be offered in writing (fillable pdf), via Zoom, or in person and should be separate from any Department specific exit interview. Be sure that employees are encouraged to complete these.

12) Employee Relations should compile an annual report on exit interviews, identifying common themes and include recommendations for improvement.

13) Publish retention data on the intranet/internet on a regular basis at the county, department, and division level. Depending on the size of the Department/Division, look at retention by Race/Ethnicity, Gender, Years of Employment, etc.

14) Expand Career Ladders – i.e. Sanitarian I, II, II, IT Specialist, Information Management Programming Specialist, Land and Water Resource Engineer, Enterprise IT Specialist, Systems Admin. Positions should have an entry (I) level, with automatic promotion to senior (II) level after a certain number of years on the job or on obtaining desired certification. Lead worker (III) level positions should be limited to internal recruitment, open to senior (II) staff with a certain number of years of experience and credentials.

15) Train up staff – pay for staff to receive necessary or desired degrees/certifications so they can advance their career, i.e., Social Service Specialist getting their MSW so they can promote to Social Worker.
16) Slow time to fill also creates burden on the unit as the work doesn't go away. The risk of burnout increases as more work is added onto the plate.
17) Proper onboarding - specifically for niche positions, allow for LTE/transition hours so that departing staff can help train the new staff. These positions often have little documentation/standards/cross-training, so the learning curve is very steep for new hires with support. The cost savings for holding some positions vacant is penny wise and pound foolish. Consider allowing overlap between retiring employees and newly hired replacements to help with transition and training.
18) Have EGR's train managers on the EBH so that they are more familiar with employees' rights and benefits.
19) Require all managers to take continuing education about topics like personnel management, bias and discrimination, budgeting, and cooperative decision-making.
20) Consider some type of mentoring structure for employees.
21) Make sure there is sufficient support staff for the work of the office, and to cover support staff absences. Does the office meet industry standard professional to support staff ratios?
22) Review benefits, such as parental leave or vacation cash out, to make sure we're keeping pace (or better than) industry standards.
23) Include classification specifications, with minimum qualifications, experience and/or education for all Department Heads and other senior management.
24) **HIGH PRIORITY:** Make sure staff pick a space and time that feels safe and comfortable for regular check-in (Quarterly or every 6 mo.) Ideally we should not wait until people leave their positions to find out what is going on and we should learn ways on how we can support them and keep them, etc.
25) **HIGH PRIORITY:** Make sure all staff are aware of the exit interview process and who has access to the information gathered from employees. Staff (HR, employee group reps, supervisors) should review the information gathered as this is best practice and brings accountability.
26) **HIGH PRIORITY:** Creating ways to have a form HR, employee groups, supervisors and the departing staff all fill out when someone leaves including termination to see if there are patterns to pay attention to.
27) **HIGH PRIORITY:** How do we protect staff from retaliation? There should be a safe way to gather concerns and feedback from staff while they are still employed.
28) **HIGH PRIORITY, 2024 BUDGET:** How do we identify income inequalities or pay disparities across Dane County and how do we plan on addressing them? Forming ways to do salary comparison/investigation and informing everyone involved should be the first step. We need to consider whether individuals receive back pay for work done underpaid.
29) **HIGH PRIORITY:** There will need to be a uniform and consistent way of doing yearly performance evaluation across departments, divisions, and programs. Currently, there are no checks and balances as to when someone who is a regular employee can receive an evaluation. There are current employees within DCDHS who have been employed for years but only received 2-3 performance evaluation sporadically. **Employee evaluation has direct correlation to retention**
30) **HIGH PRIORITY:** There will need to be a 360 evaluation system for all Dane County employees including for supervisor and managers. This system is comprehensive/inclusive, should come

from diverse poll and would bring equity to the table. **<u>Employee evaluation has direct correlation to retention</u>**

31) **<u>HIGH PRIORITY:</u>** There will need to be ways for employees to evaluate their immediate supervisor and their manager. Currently no such system exist and doing so will create accountability and fairness for all public service employees of Dane County. **<u>Employee evaluation has direct correlation to retention</u>**

32) **<u>HIGH PRIORITY, 2024 BUDGET:</u>** Audit of reclassification/reallocation process

33) **<u>HIGHER PRIORITY, 2024 BUDGET:</u>** Enhancing paid professional development opportunities for county employees, including reimbursement for certifications, licenses and higher education.

LINKS TO OTHER DOCUMENTS REFERENCED IN REPORT

1. 2016 Racial Equity and Social Justice Team's Equity Assessment of Current Recruitment/Hiring Practices Report https://board.countyofdane.com/documents/pdf/reports/Equity-Assessment-Recruitment-and-Hiring.pdf
2. Presentation by Employee Relations Division on Dane County Employee Recruitment Process 2022 PRES-233 - 2022 PRES-233 (legistar.com)
3. Dane County Alternative Selection Administrative Practices Manual 2023 PRES-065 - Alternative Selection APM (legistar.com)
4. Presentation on Dane County Highway Department Internship Program 2023 PRES-085 - 2023 PRES-085 (legistar.com)
5. Subcommittee Legislative File with all agendas and minutes https://dane.legistar.com/Calendar.aspx